## Paul Simon Outstanding Teacher-Scholar Award Scoring Guide

## **ORP Pre-Award Compliance Checklist**

If any of the first three statements are true, the application is to be returned as ineligible to apply with an explanation. If any of the remaining statements are true, the application is to be returned with an explanation. Resubmission is not allowed.

- 1. Applicant is not a tenured faculty member. Not eligible.
- 2. Applicant received the Paul Simon in the previous year. Not eligible.
- 3. All previous Internal Award requirements have not been met. Not eligible.
- 4. Application Packet attachments is not in the correct order as indicated on the KB form.
- 5. Application does not contain letters from Chair or other appropriate faculty member

- 6. Introductory Statement is less than 3 pages
- 7. Introductory Statement exceeds 5 pages (excludes Curriculum Vitae and Appendices)
- 8. Format is not compliant (e.g. 1" margins, 11-point Times New Roman or 10-point Arial font)
- 9. Curriculum Vitae is not included
- 10. CV exceeds 2 pages

## **Committee Directions:**

This scoring guide is to be used to facilitate review of all Paul Simon Outstanding Teacher-Scholar Award submissions. It is allowable in the use of this rubric to split cells and award partial credit from each cell but the total cannot exceed the highest cell used. This scoring guide addresses all elements contained in the Guidelines, which are available to all applicants. Numerical scores resulting from the use of this scoring guide can help in final decisions but do not have to be the only deciding factor.

## Paul Simon Outstanding Teacher-Scholar Award Review Committee Scoring Guide

| Component                 | 3  | 2   | 1   | 0  |
|---------------------------|--|---|---|--|
| Introductory<br>Statement | Well organized, clear statement<br>with no typographical or<br>syntax errors   | Reasonably well organized<br>and reasonably clear<br>statement with no<br>typographical or syntax   | Statement could be better<br>written and may have<br>minor typographical<br>errors  | Statement contains     multiple and/or major     typographical or     syntax errors  |
|                           | • The originality of the research/creative activity is <b>clear</b> and supported with evidence  | <ul> <li>errors</li> <li>The originality of the research/creative activity is</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>The originality of the<br/>research/creative activity is<br/>less clear and not well<br/>supported with evidence</li> </ul>      | Fails to provide     evidence that the     research/creative   |
|                           | <ul> <li>The research/creative activity<br/>has been developed<br/>continuously over time</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>clear but not as well supported with evidence</li> <li>The research/creative activity has been developed</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>The research/creative<br/>activity has been<br/>developed sporadically<br/>over time</li> </ul>                                  | activity is <b>original</b> and/or has been sustained over time  |
|                           | • The significance of the research/creative activity is clear and supported with evidence  | <ul> <li>intermittently over time</li> <li>The significance of the research/creative activity is clear but not as well</li> </ul>                                     | <ul> <li>The significance of the<br/>research/creative activity is<br/>less clear and not well<br/>supported with evidence</li> </ul>     | The significance of the research/creative activity is unclear and/or not supported   |
|                           | <ul> <li>Consistently engages students in<br/>research/creative activities as<br/>part of the instructional<br/>experience</li> </ul>                            | <ul> <li>supported with evidence</li> <li>Intermittently engages<br/>students in research/creative<br/>activities as part of the</li> </ul>                           | <ul> <li>Sporadically engages<br/>students in<br/>research/creative activities<br/>as part of the instructional<br/>experience</li> </ul> | • Seldom engages students in the research /creative activities as  |
|                           | Obviously successful in integrating the indicated research/creative activity into excellence in teaching -   | <ul> <li>instructional experience</li> <li>Successful in integrating the indicated research/creative activity into excellence in teaching - including some</li> </ul> | Successful in integrating<br>the indicated<br>research/creative activity<br>into excellence in teaching<br>- including few reasons it     | part of the instructional experience  • Unclear success in   |
|                           | including <b>multiple</b> , <b>convincing</b> reasons it was successful  | reasons it was successful   | <ul><li>was successful</li><li>Describes success in</li></ul>   | integrating the indicated research/creative  |
|                           | <ul> <li>Describes success in relation to<br/>three or more student<br/>outcomes (e.g. skills, attitudes,<br/>behaviors)</li> </ul>                              | <ul> <li>Describes success in<br/>relation to two student<br/>outcomes (e.g. skills,<br/>attitudes, behaviors)</li> </ul>   | relation to <b>one student outcome</b> (e.g. skills, attitudes, behaviors) • Includes <b>little evidence</b> of                           | activity into excellence<br>in teaching <b>and/or</b><br>lacking evidence  |
|                           | • Includes <b>substantial evidence</b> of a steady continuation of interactions that integrate outstanding research/ creative activities into excellent teaching | Includes some evidence of a steady continuation of interactions that integrate outstanding research/creative activities into excellent teaching                       | a steady continuation of interactions that integrate outstanding research/ creative activities into excellent teaching                    | Fails to include     evidence of a steady     continuation of     interactions that     integrate outstanding     research/ creative |

|                 | <ul> <li>Includes substantial evidence of<br/>sustained research/creative<br/>activities</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Includes some evidence of<br/>sustained research/creative</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Includes little evidence of<br/>sustained research/creative<br/>activities</li> </ul> | activities into excellent teaching      |
|-----------------|---|---|--|---|
|                 |   | activities  |  | • Fails to include                      |
|                 | <ul> <li>Overall, includes a strong and</li> </ul>  |   | Overall, includes a  | evidence of sustained                   |
|                 | detailed rationale for  | <ul> <li>Overall, includes a strong</li> </ul>                                | mediocre rationale for   | research/creative                       |
|                 | warranting the award  | rationale for warranting the award  | warranting the award   | activities                              |
|                 |   |   |  | <ul> <li>Overall, includes a</li> </ul> |
|                 |   |   |  | weak rationale for                      |
|                 |   |   |  | warranting the award                    |
| Introductory St | atement Comments:   |   |  |   |

| Component                 | 3  | 2  | 1  | 0  |
|---------------------------|--|--|--|--|
|                           | <ul> <li>Includes only activities most relevant to award</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Includes some<br/>activities irrelevant<br/>to award</li> </ul> | Includes few     activities relevant     to award                    | Document fails to<br>include activities<br>and/or experiences<br>relevant to the |
| Curriculum Vitae          | <ul> <li>Includes         substantial         evidence of         experiences relevant         to award</li> </ul> | Includes some     evidence of     experiences related     to award       | Includes little     evidence of     experiences related     to award | award  |
| Curriculum Vitae Comments |  |  |  |  |

| 3  | 2  | 1   | 0   |
|--|--|---|---|
| • Includes letter content that strongly details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/creative activities with excellent teaching | • Includes letter content that <u>details</u> the applicant's achievements in sustained research/ creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/ creative activities with excellent teaching | • Includes letter content that very briefly details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/creative activities with excellent teaching  | Fails to address both areas of achievement (i.e. applicant's sustained research/creative activities and creative activities with excellent teaching)  |
| ter of Support Comments  |  |   |   |
|  | content that strongly details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/ creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/ creative activities with excellent teaching                 | content that  strongly details  applicant's  achievements in  sustained research/ creative activities  and success in  linking outstanding research/ creative activities with activities with excellent teaching  content that details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/ creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/ creative activities with excellent teaching | content that strongly details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/ creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/ creative activities with excellent teaching  content that details content that very briefly details the applicant's achievements in supplicant's achievements in sustained research/ creative activities sustained research/ creative activities and success in creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/ creative activities with excellent teaching |

| Appendices – General  | Component            | 3  | 2   | 1  | 0   |
|---|----------------------|--|---|--|---|
| applicant's research or creative activity in a detailed manner  Appendices Comments | Appendices – General | More than two types of appendices are included and all are relevant to information provided in the application     All appendices provide support to application by addressing specific application content     If letters of support from peers are provided: letter content convincingly details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/creative activities with excellent teaching related to application content     If letters of support from students are provided: letter content includes multiple instances of excellent teaching and mentoring activities involving the applicant's research or creative activity in a detailed | Two types of appendices are included and all are relevant to information provided in the application  Most appendices provide support to application by addressing specific application content  If letters of support are provided: letter content details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/creative activities with excellent teaching related to application content  If letters of support from students are provided: letter content includes multiple instances of excellent teaching and mentoring activities involving the applicant's research | <ul> <li>Includes only one type of appendix and is relevant to information provided in the application</li> <li>Some appendices provide support to application by addressing specific application content</li> <li>If letters of support are provided: letter content briefly details the applicant's achievements in sustained research/creative activities and success in linking outstanding research/creative with excellent teaching related to application content</li> <li>If letters of support from students are provided: letter content includes multiple instances of excellent teaching or mentoring activities involving the applicant's research</li> </ul> | Appendices do not provide support for content in Introductory |